

**THE
CHURCH'S
MISSION
IN A
POLARIZED
WORLD**



Living the Feminist Dream

A Faithful Vision for Women
in the Church and the World

Kate Bryan

Keep at it, Riley!

Accompanying my Father
through Death into Life

Noreen Madden McInnes

Rehumanize

A Vision to Secure Human Rights for All

Aimee Murphy

**THE
CHURCH'S
MISSION
IN A
POLARIZED
WORLD**

Aaron Wessman



Published by New City Press

202 Comforter Blvd.,

Hyde Park, NY 12538

www.newcitypress.com

©2023 Aaron Wessman

The Church's Mission in a Polarized World

Aaron Wessman

Cover design and layout by Miguel Tejerina

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022951994

ISBN: 978-1-56548-549-5 (Paperback)

ISBN: 978-1-56548-550-1 (E-book)

To those who are family to me: givers of life and love,
sustainers of vocation, inspiration for learning, founts of
wisdom and joy, and reasons for existence.



Contents

Series Preface

Introduction

My Concern

A Way Forward

Structure

The Scope of this Project

Chapter One

What is Polarization? Sorting, Homogenization, and Intensification

The Perfect Storm

Sorting

Geographical Sorting

Identity-Based Sorting: Politics

Identity Based Sorting: Race, Religion, and More

Online Sorting

Homogenization

Uniformity through Sorting

Homogeneity by Group Pressure

Uniformity by Decision

Interlude

Chapter Two

What is Polarization? Intensification

“Things are Heating Up”

The (Increasing) Importance of Group Belonging

Group Belonging as Necessary for Survival: Psychological Perspectives

Fragility and the Need for Group Belonging

Original Fragility and the Need for Group Belonging

Social Fragility and the Importance of Groups

The Increasing Importance of Political Groups

Political Identities as Mega-Identities

Some Consequences of Mega-Identities

The Rising Influence of Party Identity

Increasingly Hostile Engagement Between Political Groups

Wired for Inter-Group Conflict

Politics as Us Versus Them

Negative Polarization

Intensifying Negativity

Conclusion

Chapter Three

The Church and Polarization

“This is not who I am.”

The Church as One, Holy, Catholic, and Apostolic

Unity within the Church

The Witness of St. Paul

A Struggle for Unity in the Church

Unity with the World

The Witness of St. Francis

A Struggle for Unity with the World

The Church and Holiness

The Witness of St. Damien of Molokai

A Struggle for Holiness in the Church

The Church as ‘Catholic’

The Witness of St. Thomas Aquinas

A Struggle for a ‘Catholic’ Mind Today

Christians Growing in ‘Apostolicity’

The Witness of Dorothy Day

A Struggle to Be Formed by Faith Today

Conclusion

Chapter Four

Responding to the Storms of Polarization

[“They are doing *what*?”](#)

[Some Preliminary Points](#)

[The Culture War: In Their Own Words](#)

[The Power of Metaphors](#)

[War as a Metaphor and the Demands of the Gospel](#)

[A Charitable Assessment of the War Metaphor](#)

[The War Metaphor and the ‘Other’](#)

[The War Metaphor and Christian Missionary Engagement](#)

[Recapitulation](#)

[The Metaphor for Christians to Live By: Jesus’ Incarnational Movement](#)

Chapter Five

Discipleship as Crossing Over

[Crossing into the Storm to Save Lives](#)

[The Cost of Missionary Discipleship](#)

[The Costs of Crossing Over](#)

[The Importance of Crossing Over: Some Preliminary Considerations](#)

[The Importance of Crossing Over: The Example of Jesus](#)

[The Son of God Crossing Over in the Incarnation](#)

[Jesus’ Crossing Over in His Public Ministry](#)

[Crossing Over in His Passion and Death](#)

[The Church’s Motivation](#)

Chapter Six

Discipleship and Salvific Encounter

[“How in the world did I get here?”](#)

[Salvific Encounter as the Eye of the Storm](#)

[Salvific Encounters through a Ministry of Presence](#)

[Flexibility in the Storm](#)

[The Flexibility of Jesus in His Ministry](#)

[Flexibility and the Science of Polarization](#)

[Cultivating Flexibility](#)

[Curiosity in the Storm](#)

[*The Curiosity of Jesus in His Ministry*](#)

[*Curiosity and the Science of Polarization*](#)

[*Cultivating Curiosity*](#)

[*Prudence in the Storm*](#)

[*The Prudence of Jesus in His Ministry*](#)

[*The Importance of Prudence Based on the Science of Polarization*](#)

[*Cultivating Prudence*](#)

[*Conclusion*](#)

Chapter Seven

Hope in the Storm

[*Stories of Great Heroism*](#)

[*Courageous Individuals in the Storm*](#)

[*Daryl Davis*](#)

[*Brother Craig Digmann, G.H.M.*](#)

[*Chris Arnade*](#)

[*Hopeful Organizations in the Storm*](#)

[*Braver Angels*](#)

[*Divided We Fall*](#)

[*Sant'Egidio*](#)

[*Creative Contributions in the Storm*](#)

[*Conclusion*](#)



Series Preface

Does the book that you are about to read seem unusual? Perhaps even counterintuitive?

Good. The Magenta series wouldn't be doing its job if you felt otherwise.

On the color wheel, magenta lies directly between red and blue. Just so, books in this series do not lie at one limit or another of our hopelessly simplistic, two-dimensional, antagonistic, binary imagination. Often, in the broader culture any answer to a moral or political question gets labeled as liberal or conservative, red or blue. But the Magenta series refuses to play by these shortsighted rules. Magenta will address the complexity of the issues of our day by resisting a framework that unnecessarily pits one idea against another. Magenta refuses to be defined by anything other than a positive vision of the good.

If you understand anything about the Focolare's dialogical-and-faithful mission, it should not surprise you that this series has found a home with the Focolare's New City Press. The ideas in these books, we believe, will spark dialogues that will heal divides and build unity at the very sites of greatest fragmentation and division.

The ideas in Magenta are crucial not only for our fragmented culture, but also for the Church. Our secular idolatry—our simplistic left/right, red/blue imagination—has oozed into the Church as well, disfiguring the Body of Christ with ugly disunity. Such idolatry, it must be said, has muffled the Gospel and crippled the Church, keeping it from being salt and light in a wounded world desperate for unity.

Magenta is not naïve. We realize full well that appealing to dialogue or common ground can be dismissed as a weak-sauce,

milquetoast attempt to cloud our vision of the good or reduce it to a mere least common denominator. We know that much dialogic spade work is yet to be done, but that does not keep the vision of the Magenta Series (like the color it bears) from being *bold*. There is nothing half-hearted about it. All our authors have a brilliant, attractive vision of the good.

To say that Aaron Wessman's book is a perfect fit for the series would be quite an understatement. Indeed, in many ways Magenta was created to express "The Church's Mission in a Polarized World." The term 'polarization' gets thrown around a lot, however, and one of the great features of the book you are about to read is contained in the first two chapters: a detailed, careful, precise undertaking of what it is we are attempting to resist. The rest of the book goes on to describe literally dozens of ideas and strategies for the Church to resist polarization. Of particular interest is Wessman's understanding of discipleship as "crossing over" in order to have an encounter. He does not, however, withhold clear headed warnings about the costs that come with doing so—costs which very much resemble the Focolare's understanding that authentic dialogue sometimes means connecting with "Jesus Forsaken" on the cross. Wessman's uniquely magenta vision and style of engagement perform the very thing to which he is calling us. Readers coming from multiple, plural, and even divergent perspectives will all benefit from reading this book. And may even find it to be a meeting place through which they can encounter each other.

Enjoy!

Charles C. Camosy

Series Editor

Introduction

Negative polarization and division in the United States are affecting all that we hold dear: our country, communities, schools, places of worship, relationships, and families. The scene is heartbreaking. I imagine that if you are reading this introduction, your life has been touched, in some way, by this turmoil.

Across the United States, good, thoughtful, and caring people are being subsumed into the vitriolic intensity of cultural polarization. Even as it happens, and as they try desperately to avoid it, they become something they do not want to be. They are like Dorian Gray gazing upon the monster that has materialized on the canvas even as he continues the very behavior creating the monstrosity.

Holiday family gatherings, sadly, present a glimpse of the effects of American polarization. For those who decide to gather—rather than choosing to remain at home to avoid conflict—the tension is palpable. People sit next to each other at the table in silence. Family members with shared memories—year upon year of journeying together—and who pump similar blood through their veins, have little to say. What can they talk about that will not induce rage or conflict? Religion? That is off the table. Football? Even ‘America’s game’ is rife with pitfalls. Politics? Not a chance. Few broached subjects, especially during election cycles, are navigable. One person speaks. Another interrupts. The table is pounded. Meals end prematurely.

The microcosm of the strained family gathered around a holiday table is influenced by the macro cultural environment. Not ever, perhaps, has so much ink been spilled warning Americans of the potential for a second civil war, possible cessation, or ineluctable deepening division. Stories and

articles signaling impending danger are surrounded by the very thing causing the problem: depictions of the 'other group' in a negative light, or coverage of yet another politician buttressing her popularity through negativity. The intensification of negative polarization is tearing the United States apart at the seams. Even as I write these words, I am unsure how stable the country will be when they are published.

And then there is the Church. As a Catholic priest, that the Body of Christ would be my main concern is logical. To witness members who are united in divine bonds by the power of the Holy Spirit treat their fellow Christians with contempt beyond contempt is devastating. We in the Church have consumed the same Communion, been united in the same salvific sacrifice, stood together, and witnessed our children baptized, confirmed, and married, cried on each other's shoulders at death's presence, and confessed our sins to Our Father so as to journey together to our homeland. Yet, the profound mischaracterizations and irrational hatred of our fellow brothers and sisters in Christ, sometimes simply because they share different political views or divergent ecclesial perspectives, reek of Cain's proto-rage against Abel. These behaviors and feelings belie the unity and charity Christ desired his members to instantiate in the world, and weaken the Church's evangelical mission.

Even ministers tasked with leading their flock have caved under the pressure to unite divided churchgoers. They seek wisdom from heaven about how to proceed in these unprecedented times, while knowing that they, too, contribute to a polarized milieu.

My Concern

The following book is as personal as it is communal. Even as I bemoan the carnage around me left in the wake of the cultural storm of polarization, I also realize that I am just as susceptible to its influence. I am just as concerned with what is happening inside of me.

In 2017, following nearly four years studying in Europe, I returned to America and witnessed these ‘united’ states breaking apart. The anger and divisiveness were tangible. They were perhaps most obvious because I had been away for so long, sheltered from the conflict and rancor.

Questions abounded. What had happened to our country? What occurred within our Church? I thought I could remain above the fray and avoid the polemics, and yet I was immediately dragged in. Why did the anger rise in me? Was I really unable to watch certain news outlets without getting upset? What had happened to some of my loved ones? Why was I so easily triggered by particular political topics or the mere mention of certain politicians? Why did my heart fill with frustration when this or that Church official spoke? What happened to my ability to listen charitably to differing opinions and thoughts? Where was kindness?

As years passed from my entrance back into the United States, social and ecclesial divisions deepened and cultural wounds festered. With urgency, I began searching for answers.

Though much remains unknown, as the cultural markers of polarization continue to shift and evolve, this book is an attempt to synthesize some of my research into this field. If you feel the same urgency as I do, or if you are simply a fellow pilgrim along this road, I hope the following words are, in some way, like Virgil’s guidance leading the way out of the underworld.

A Way Forward

Though it pains me to have to make this admission, I believe that part of the way forward can only be found in admitting that the Church in the United States has, in part, lost her way through this valley of tears. I will, with trepidation, suggest some of the ways that this has likely taken place. However, I suspect that the lasting influence of this book will not arise from my critique. The lasting influence will come by the way in which readers, myself included, ponder within themselves to what extent negative polarization has touched their own lives.

Only in recognizing where each of us needs to grow will the path forward be seen more clearly.

And yet there is always hope. God provides the Church a way forward during every age she encounters. Our age is no different.

Though I am certainly not claiming any kind of prophetic insight, I will argue in this book that part of this way forward can be found in reflecting upon, and imitating, Jesus' incarnational movement. Through his *kenosis*—in emptying himself and 'taking on flesh'—the Son of God crossed over into a world filled with strife, division, and destitution, to encounter and to save that world. He did not spurn or hide from the world. Mysteriously, he embraced it in every way but sin. His followers, not being divine, can only analogously—and prudently—imitate this movement. Nevertheless, I contend that it is within this incarnational movement—a crossing over to the 'other' with Christ—that the Church can recover the correct path to her journey home. Only in doing so will the Church sufficiently differentiate herself from and purify polarizing impulses, thereby bringing salvation and unity to a world in need of both.

Structure

To explore the aforementioned themes, chapters one and two of this book will utilize political, sociological, psychological and theological research to answer the question: What is polarization? These chapters will pull from wonderfully written work addressing the sociopolitical reality of polarization in the United States. I will argue that polarization is best understood as the formation of two storms swirling and causing havoc in these fractured states of America.

Chapter three will pivot to an investigation of polarization and the Church. This chapter will proceed as a kind of examination of conscience for the Church—for Christians (including myself)—to ask how the logic of polarization is possibly affecting our discipleship as Christians, and undermining the fundamental tasks of the Church in the

world. Rather than explore individual theological challenges and disagreements existing within the Church, this chapter will investigate how polarizing tendencies seem to be limiting the Church's ability to live fully the mystery she is to be in and for the world.

Chapter four will specifically analyze one of the problematic responses the Church has taken to counter the effects of polarization. The 'culture war' metaphor will be diagnosed as a cancer within the Church's missionary endeavors. Jesus' incarnational movement will be proposed as the medicinal metaphor that can potentially bring healing.

Chapters five and six will unpack the consequences of the metaphor of Jesus' incarnational movement for the life of the Church. What it means for the Church to 'cross over' to embrace the other, and to bring about 'salvific encounters' in the world, will be explored. In delving into the nature of Jesus' incarnational movement, and what this metaphor means for the Church in a polarized world, hopefully, I will begin to chart a path forward that can be pursued prudently in these tumultuous times.

The final chapter will explore contemporary examples of people who, and organizations that, are participating in aspects of Jesus' 'incarnational movement' in this world. These examples provide hope in the midst of the storms, and can serve as inspiration for Christians (and others) going forward.

The Scope of this Project

I love the United States, even as I recognize its complex and imperfect history. Traveling around the world has deepened my appreciation of this vast and beautiful country that I call home. Nevertheless, my primary concern in this book is not how polarization is affecting America in general. Many people have sought to address this theme. They have presented possible ways forward from a societal and political perspective. Their thoughts will infuse these pages. However, this book is neither about political policy, nor individual political parties or candidates.

What I am vitally concerned about are my primary loves: Christ and the Church he has founded. I write this not to signal that these loves are in any way lived perfectly in my life, but because I will be providing a critique of something I—and I know others—hold dear. I desire to show how polarization is affecting, or has the potential to affect, the Church, and how the Church might respond in light of her call to live as Jesus' followers in this world. Through every generation, the Church has encountered various challenges that shape her missionary vision and practice. Polarization is our challenge.

This does not mean, of course, that the words within this book are divorced from broader societal and political problems in the United States. The Church does not exist in a vacuum. Quite the contrary, the more the Church lives according to her nature, the more the cultures and societies in which she is present, and which influence her, benefit from her presence, and she from them.

There is little doubt that the Church will respond to the challenge of polarization. In many ways this is already happening. What that response should or could be is at stake. Hopefully, the following pages provide some assistance to readers and stimulate courage, so that Christians can see the age in which we live more clearly and respond with grace to follow more fully the call God has spoken.